

A Conceptual Review of Human Resource Management Research in Turkey

Prof. Dr. Serkan BAYRAKTAROĐLU¹
sbayraktaroglu@hotmail.com, Turkey

Dr. Erhan ATAY
Senior Lecturer, Monash University Malaysia,
E-mail: erhan.atay@monash.edu

Abstract

The paper focuses on the developmental process of the Turkish HRM literature from the PhD level knowledge-creation and dissemination perspective. Since research reflects the current state of contextual conditions, describing the significant influences of the context of HRM research can reveal how HRM develops over time. The research content-analyzed the PhD theses completed in the field of HRM as a means of enriching the qualitative data. The study shows that there is a dominance of personnel management in line with the individual HRM practices oriented research and the emergence of SHRM in Turkey. Problems with the lack of being critical and not establishing ties with the Turkish context still maintain their validity in the literature. Future studies should explore the roles and impact of talent and acquisition issues such as employer branding, employability and innovative HR capital development, and the challenges they face in the transfer of management knowledge and practices towards human capital development within organizations. There appears to be only a small number of studies, following the new trends within the discipline. The study is a contribution to the understanding of the development trajectories of HRM in Turkey as an example of developing economies.

Keywords: HRM, HRM in Turkey, HRM Knowledge-Creation, HRM in Developing Countries.

Özet

Çalışma, doktora düzeyinde bilgi üretme ve yayma perspektifinden Türk İKY literatürünün gelişim sürecine odaklanmaktadır. Araştırma, bağlamsal koşulların mevcut durumunu yansıttığından, İKY arařtırmalarının bağlamını etkileyen başlıca faktörleri tanımlanarak, İKY'nin zaman içinde nasıl geliştiđi ortaya çıkarılabilir. Araştırma, İKY alanında tamamlanan doktora tezlerini nitel verileri zenginleřtirmenin bir aracı olarak analiz etmiştir. Çalışma, bireysel İKY uygulamalarına yönelik arařtırmalarla, her ne kadar stratejik İKY'den bahsedilse de personel yönetiminin baskın olduğunu göstermektedir. Eleřtirel olmama ve Türk bağlamıyla ilgi kurmama problemleri literatürde geçerliliđini korumaktadır. Gelecekteki çalışmalar, işveren markası, istihdam edilebilirlik ve yenilikçi insan sermayesi gelişimi gibi yetenek yönetimi konularının rolünü ve etkisini ve yönetim bilgi ve uygulamalarının örgüt içinde insan sermayesi gelişimine aktarılmasında karşılařtıkları zorlukları arařtırmalıdır. Disiplindeki yeni eğilimleri takip eden az sayıda çalışma olduğu görülmektedir. Çalışma, gelişmekte olan ekonomilere örnek olarak Türkiye'de İKY'nin gelişim evrelerinin anlaşılmasına katkıda bulunmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: İKY, Türkiye'de İKY, İKY ve Bilgi Üretme, Gelişmekte Olan Ülkelerde İKY.

Introduction

Given the general trend of the human resource management (HRM) discipline, it is notable that the related literature began to develop in the West, in its early stages, and is followed at a particular "track distance" behind in developing countries (Nasurdin et al., 2008; Bratton and Gold, 2012). Since research reflects the current state of contextual conditions, describing the significant influences of the context of HRM research can reveal how HRM develops over time (Cooke, 2018). This argument

¹ Corresponding author

highlights the need to examine the context in HRM research to access the history and development of HRM in developing economies (Budhwar & Debrah, 2009; Poon & Rowley, 2010).

In this study, the scope of the field of HRM in Turkey will be reviewed, and with the help of empirical studies, the development of HRM discipline in Turkey will be analysed in the context of the production of knowledge at the PhD level.

In this study, the point which Turkish HRM has reached was analysed through PhD theses completed after the year 2000, because the term "HRM" has been used since the year 2000 in Turkey (Bayraktaroglu & Atay, 2016). PhD theses may be considered to be the core developmental viewpoints of a country-specific analysis on the discipline of HRM. Although the context is essential for HRM research, particularly in developing economies that have been going through institutional changes, systematic reviews of HRM development in such settings have been scant (Cooke, 2018). The characteristics of the Turkish economy and Turkish culture (religion, ethnicity, language, tradition, history, and so on) have been a bridge between East and West, providing an excellent context to examine the nature of HRM in Turkey.

The central research question of this study is: "What the current state of HRM literature development in Turkey is, as reflected by the PhD theses on HRM for the period after 2000?" We take this approach as the development of HRM in developing countries is better understood by a historical and institutional review (Tregaskis and Brewster, 2006).

Theoretical Review: Institutional Perspective in HRM Studies in Turkey

The institutional environment includes the government, regulatory agencies, the professions, social expectations and leading organisations (Powell and DiMaggio, 2012). New institutionalism proposes the isomorphism of organisational practices in a specific environment with three different versions: coercive, mimetic and normative mechanisms (Scott, 2008). Organizations tend to benchmark and implement similar practices or imitate successful or legitimate organisations in their field (Powell and DiMaggio, 2012). These three versions of isomorphism lead to the homogeneity of HRM development and, across organisations in the same environment, adoption of practices that gain organisations legitimacy, or increase their probability of survival and organisational performance. Although organisations tend to be isomorphic in the same environment, they are likely to use their HR practices to be different, inimitable, and non-substitutable, in order to be more successful in both local and global markets (Farndale et al., 2008). Perceptions of HRM functions have been found to be influenced by contextual factors (Jackson and Schuler, 1995). In general, previous studies on HRM that have applied a lens of the institutional theory have concluded that the institutional environment determines the level of HRM development at a national level and the adoption of HRM into organisations (Boon et al., 2009).

In the 1980s, globalisation, international competitions and institutional changes in regulations, unionisation and demographic variations occurring in the US led to the growth of HRM analysis (Ulrich and Dulebohn, 2015). The prior studies have confirmed that institutional and economic forces have played an essential role in determining the development of HRM in a particular context (Aycan, 2001; Mellahi et al., 2013).

In Turkey, HRM studies have lately been receiving more attention from researchers. Early studies related to HRM, personnel management or management practices focused on cultural dimensions in Turkey (Aycan, 2001). Hofstede (1980) showed that Turkish culture is high on collectivism and power distance. Furthermore, analysis by Aycan (2001) also suggested that Turkish culture has more paternalistic values. Kabasakal and Bodur (1998) stated that Turkish culture has low-performance orientation, future orientation, human orientation and uncertainty avoidance. Berkman and Özen (2008) concluded that Turkish managerial culture has gradually become less paternalistic and

collectivistic, and more masculine and risk-taking. As a result of these interactions, the working culture of Turkish firms has started to become a mixture of Western and Eastern values and systems.

Turkish HRM Literature

Although some topics relating to personnel management appeared in business and economics literature before the 1950s (Üsdiken and Çetin, 1999); it was only through the end of the 1960s and at the beginning of 1970s that the personnel management discipline was accepted as an independent discipline. In 1955, the first book was published with "Personnel" in its title, in 1964, the first PhD thesis with the title of "personnel management" was completed and the first lecture notes entitled "Personnel Management" were published (Üsdiken and Wasti, 2002: 1-2).

Erçek (2006) pointed out that some critical phenomena and actors, as well as the transfer of HRM knowledge to Turkey, are made through foreign-owned organisations. HRM knowledge has been disseminated from core/central countries to peripheries by translation in most cases.

Üsdiken and Wasti (2002) claimed that researchers working on PM and HRM between 1972 and 1999 had a more universalistic view. Thus the early researchers made a limited amount of connection to the Turkish context, and there have appeared very few critical perspectives taken within PM/HRM literature. Within the HRM researchers, since the theory and concepts of HRM were presumed to be valid universally, the models' validity between different cultural settings and contextual relationships are not questioned. There is a possible explanation for this situation in that researchers' upbringing, and education process may result in a different paradigm, being more in the British way or the American way.

Turkey has been mainly an open country regarding knowledge transfer concerning HRM practices and the management paradigms that have originated from the USA (Usdiken, 1996). However, academia contributed to the production and dissemination of this knowledge mainly by the researchers obtaining their Ph.Ds. abroad, although in the early stages, only interpretations of the knowledge produced in another country were seen as adequate for scientific development. It must be noted that the socio-cultural environment in Turkey is still markedly different from the Western world, as it is a newly industrialising country with a society imbued with traditional and modern values (Wasti, 1998). The most popular topics within HRM literature generally focus on the relationships of HR practices with employee behavioural implications and the business performances of the organisations (Hung et al., 2004). In Eastern cultures, organisational behaviour concepts profoundly affect HRM practices.

The HRM discipline, in Turkey, has been incorporated within the production process as the most critical value in profit maximisation. "The names of the personnel divisions of the companies changed into HR departments overnight as well as changing the titles of the textbooks from Personnel Management to HRM without changing the contents" (Bratton and Gold, 2012) and this was the case in Turkey.

Methodology

In this study, the PhD theses completed after the year 2000 and containing the expression "HRM" in their keywords section are sampled for content analysis. The database of the Higher Education Institution of Turkey was used to show the level of the inclusion of HRM within PhD theses as a sign of the interest within Turkish Academia. There were 115 PhD thesis included in the study as they had either full text or abstracts in the database.

Data Collection Methods of the Theses

Surveys were used in most (82%) of the theses analysed, and some qualitative research methods were also employed as case studies (3%), and text analysis (4%) with content analysis and discourse analysis. There are a few examples (only 6%) of enrichment of the data by surveys as well as in-depth interviews for both qualitative and quantitative analysis. There was no triangulation. 5% of the theses did not have any data collected.

A Sampling of the Theses

The primary sampling strategy seems to be randomly selected (or more precisely, easily-accessed) data which sometimes does not reflect the reality. There are very few purposeful samplings, which is "an objective way of generating a picture of the reality" (Seidman, 2013). There is only one cross-cultural study (1%) and no cross-regional studies at all. Mostly private companies are sampled (83%) with 14% sampling from the public sector, and there are only two public sector-private sector comparisons (3%). There is a "big 500 fetishisms" in the PhD theses in Turkish academia, as most studies tend to use the largest 500 companies as a data set. The general criticism of Turkish HRM is that the researchers have mainly imported the international concepts and scales without question and that the cultural dimensions of the issues are often neglected.

Analysis Methods of the Theses

Mostly, replication surveys with reliability analysis are used (82%) as the questionnaires and scales widely accepted by academia are safer to use regarding acceptability by the committees. It is very rare to see post-modern qualitative research strategies such as critical discourse analysis, grounded theory and so on. No researcher has used observations for their research, and they may well use the triangulation strategy, as HR is an area where researchers can explore the relationships in-depth only by active participation.

Most of the theses have adopted the positivist approach of trying to prove the causal relationship on the surface by employing quantitative research methods. However, a more in-depth analysis should be designed to enrich the data and deepen the knowledge of Turkish HRM issues. The least studied topics of the PhD theses were HPWS, innovation, downsizing, ethics, HRIS and other contemporary issues that have been studied in the developed world for a long time.

Research Results and Discussion

In the 1970s, the academic research about personnel management in Turkey focused on specific PM applications and the physical conditions that employment would provide. The universality of personnel management information has not been questioned and generally making a connection with Turkey has been limited (Üsdiken and Wasti, 2002). The problems with critics and the relationship with Turkey still maintain it is a problem in the HRM field. While the researchers until the year 2000 were justified in guiding the application of the field, and the scientific contribution was not a concern after the year 2000 researchers nevertheless began to contribute to the science taking place in the field. However, sometimes outstanding scale development efforts, by the translation of foreign scales that generally mean "replication" scales, have led to an increase in the number of empirical publications. It is observed that the number of qualitative researchers is smaller and does not have a stable trend. There are several critiques of HRM studies. For example, the studies seem to focus on the relation of HRM practices in factors like the performance of employees and the business. As Usdiken (1996) states, the bulk of Turkish HRM ideas and practices have been adopted

from foreign countries, as the sector is developing primarily by learning from international expertise. Adopting new practices and a burgeoning tutorial interest concerning HRM have enabled HRM's progress in Turkey.

Conceptual Review of the HRM Research in Turkey

The content-analysed theses may be considered a reflection of the Turkish HRM paradigm on the theoretical level. As there have not been any institutionalised international Turkish scientific journals on HRM available, PhD theses are taken as examples of the paradigm for researchers of HRM. Content analysis of the PhD theses between the year 2000 and 2018 revealed the following points:

Research Paradigm

Research topics are dependent upon the US and UK-driven frameworks, as most of the studies have some connection made between the theoretical developmental level and the actual business practices. Most of the theses are empirical-based, (96%, which is 110 of the 115 theses on HRM between 2000-2018), and 4% of them are only a literature review, with no conceptual study as a contribution to the literature. The research paradigm is managerialism seeking to find better ways to maximise the productivity of the business units, and this paradigm may be considered to be somewhat capitalist.

Theoretical Framework of the Theses

As a result of the content analysis of the theses, only 4% of the theses have a conceptual framework to be developed. Most of the theses are conducted on topics including general HRM (30%), OB concepts related to HRM concepts (15%), performance management (12%), recruitment (7%), strategic HRM (6%), international HRM (4%), employer branding (4%), E-HRM and HRIS (3%), reward management (3%) and others. Mostly, HR functions are evaluated within these theses, and sometimes the connection with the OB concepts are made with consideration for the well-being of the employees. However, it is a promising fact that OB has an essential place in HRM postgraduate studies in Turkish universities. It is useful to integrate HR processes with more human factors borrowed from OB literature, such as empowerment, job satisfaction, leadership, OCB and so on.

There are very exceptional studies on OHS (2%), talent management (2%), social media (1%) innovation (1%), HPWS (1%) and critical HRM and national HRM systems (3%). These topics are hot topics within the international literature.

Presenting an overall picture within the PhD theses is very difficult as there are vast variations in HRM practices among organisations. However, here are some observations about the PhD theses on HRM topics:

Recruitment

A striking feature of the PhD theses on HRM is that there is no thesis conducted on HR planning, as in reality, only less than half of the large companies report that they conduct HR planning. This situation may be due to the uncertainty caused by economic instability and political volatility in Turkey in recent years. Recruitment, from the international perspective, means "the process of attracting individuals on a timely basis, in sufficient numbers and with appropriate qualifications, to apply for jobs with an organisation" (Mondy, 2008), and is taken as a process from a broader perspective. However, in Turkey, recruitment means only finding and hiring employees, excluding HR planning and without being related to the training and development functions. The retention perspective of

employees has been considered in only some theses, proposing that “employees' adoption of organizational culture, sense of belonging and loyalty make it possible to retain” (Cakal, 2017:2). In practice, the most popular recruitment channels include suggestions from employees, relatives and friends, as well as using social networks in recruitment, and selection reflects the collectivistic nature of the culture. Competency-based recruitment models have been introduced by some theses, proposing that these models may be successful if a company's top management believes in the value of competency-based recruitment systems and talent management applications (Bayraktar, 2002: 169).

Training and Development

Training and development are among the most critical topics of HRM and underrepresented in developing countries (Radzi et al., 2017). Training and development functions have been neglected in the PhD theses, especially with technological developments applied to the area of training and development. In theory, training and development is a significant component of a talent management process, but in reality, organisations use training as a way to increase organisational commitment and job satisfaction. The cost of the training process is the primary concern for companies in Turkey. However, the motivation side of recruitment and training seems to have been neglected by the PhD theses. Training programs are aimed at affecting performance indicators. “These performance indicators include the indicators that are used in the definition of competences in the participant firm's performance appraisal system” (Ozyurt, 2010).

Performance Evaluation

Performance evaluation is one of the most challenging HRM functions for the organisations and in Asian organisations, the applications of performance evaluation have been already limited (Iqbal, 2012). In the PhD theses on performance appraisal related topics, although most of the companies reported having a performance-evaluation system, it is difficult to obtain a bias-free assessment. There are problems associated with the nature and measurement of performance criteria as well as the highly subjective and biased evaluations: “The main reasons for the subjective performance appraisal systems are: the evaluation systems of the organisations do not have adequate infrastructure and database as well as the systems solely based on catching the weak dimensions of the employees' performances” (Akin, 2009:190). In a high power distance culture, the majority of organisations do in practice conduct performance evaluations as a top-down process, but in theory, as reflected by the PhD theses, more innovative evaluation, methods including the 360-degree performance-evaluation system, have been proposed. Subordinates find it very difficult to evaluate their superiors as this would be against the collectivistic norms of Turkish culture. Most of the theses used contemporary performance appraisal methods. Competency-based performance appraisal systems have been found to be a useful tool for effective HRM systems.

Measurement is a vital part of an effective HR system that links HR activities with organizational performance. “One of the most important aspects of measuring the HR contribution is to identify appropriate measures that accurately reflect overall HR performance” (Tuzuner, 2002).

Reward and Compensation

Reward and compensation functions of HRM are negatively related to turnover (Bawa and Jantan, 2005). Although reward management is seen as one of the most important functions of HR, this is not reflected by the PhD theses. “As well as having an effect on the costs and the performance of the company and its employees, wage management is also a part of human resources management and is thought to affect the labour turnover” (Sardan, 2012:203). “Reward system is greatly affected by the external economic and internal physical-social working conditions, and financial motivational factors” (Yenipinar, 2004: vii). Reward management should be interconnected with the performance

appraisal process. Performance-based reward allocation is administered mainly for white-collar employees, as blue-collar employees have been neglected in most cases.

Career Management and Development

Most of the companies have career management systems linked to the performance evaluation system. However, in the PhD theses, the importance of career development and related concepts have been neglected. Traditional methods are considered rather than contemporary career management approaches. "It is proposed that a career system method, which is structured in coordination with a public relations unit would provide efficiency, quality for the working life and satisfaction for the employees" (Yaylaci, 2000:v).

HRM and Ethics

HRM in Turkey is a "developing field" in a "developing country" (Aycan, 2006). As the process of EU integration and new labour law have stimulated the demand for more efficient HRM systems, there have been some efforts to support the development of the discipline of HRM both in theory and practice. The high number of PhD theses show that HRM as a field in Turkey is expected to have a bright future. However, some neglected topics related to HRM such as ethics and corporate governance are critical issues in this transformation. There are violations of ethics in HRM practices in Turkey (Bayraktaroglu & Ersoy Yilmaz, 2012). For example, equal employment opportunities are not always observed. There is a pervasive problem of favouritism and nepotism in recruitment and selection, as well as in performance appraisal and promotion. However, a high relationship with a positive orientation between business ethics application by HRM and organizational performance has been determined (Ersoy, 2012).

Strategic HRM

The theses on strategic HRM in Turkey have aimed at promoting the HR function to a more strategic status to transform organisations. However, the real challenge is to convince the top management about it. The theses have made theoretical propositions borrowed from the international literature which may not be realistic in the Turkish context. The result has been partially effective HRM systems and a loss of trust in HRM departments. Some PhD theses proposed universal principles for local organisations as stated by Wasti (1998), and many organisations have attempted to implement US-based HRM practices without considering whether these would fit their own cultural context or not.

Most of the studies were designed with a positivist approach, trying to explore managerial strategies for better financial results. This is the case especially with performance management (profit maximisation) and strategic HRM (gaining competitive advantage for profit maximisation). "The strategic human resources management approach which takes human capital as the basic source of the competitive advantage is positively related to organizational performance in Turkey's big firms" (Genc, 2009: xii). However, the importance given to OB concepts within the HRM research framework may be related to the well-being of the employees, as this has attracted researchers more recently. Studies on recruitment, employer branding and HRIS are also seen as useful tools for productive employees. These are all the examples and reflections of the top-down paradigm of the HRM in Turkey. HRM research and practices seem to serve the owners of the companies rather than employees, as is criticised in industrial relations and strategic HRM literature.

Conclusion

Human resources management has assumed a more strategic role than ever in evolving company structures. Parallel to that progress, one-to-one relationships between an organisation and its employees have started to gain importance within the HRM framework. HRM is described as a field of science and practice. In this study, we have analysed the PhD theses conducted in the field of HRM

since the year 2000 to determine the current situation of HRM in Turkey. Consequently, a remarkable point in the development of HRM discipline in Turkey is the narrowing of the gap between different language used by the academics and practitioners as a symbol of their different viewpoints, and in this regard, there appear to be signs of the emergence of a mutual understanding of the theory and practice of HRM in Turkey. However, while academic and practice conferences and summits held every year are focused on similar issues, it cannot be said that both perspectives coincide literally. It is necessary to increase either the common projects or the theses and studies, in order to integrate academic and industrial perspectives. In particular, it is essential to link the theses with the realities of the country to reveal common sense.

When the empirical studies in the field are overseen, it would be more accurate to evaluate the topics that have been extensively studied and are observed to have been addressed adequately in order to make some inferences. That said, at first glance, the research about employee and business performance, performance evaluation, human resource management and technology relations, compensation and reward management and behavioural processes (organisational commitment, motivation, leadership, and work-life balance) seem to have been extensively studied. But the level of research on occupational health and safety is low to non-existent in the field, and this can be explained as another indicator of the paradigm of Turkish HRM still representing the issues from a managerialist perspective.

This study was conducted to explain the trajectories of HR knowledge production and dissemination towards creating an HR discipline in Turkey, and most secondary data were used. In this context, if we analyse the development trajectories of the discipline of HRM in Turkey, the discipline has two sides, academic and practical, and their respective development levels are different. This leads to the conclusion that as the Western-based research paradigm is dominating the HRM field in Turkey, and the researchers are influenced by the present HRM problems of the Western world, the studies can therefore not capture the local agenda and realities of the country. Another striking fact is that in most theses, books and textbooks on HRM are written with a top-down perspective, and in this respect, Turkish HRM has diverged from industrial relations. With a more macro and American perspective adopted within Turkish HRM, in recent years, there appears to have been a paradigm shift, as HRM is converging more with OB discipline and is using common concepts and perspectives in some studies, and is becoming more micro and employee-centred.

This study aimed at analysing the process of creating HRM literature on the doctorate-level. It was concluded that problems with the lack of it being critical, and not establishing ties with the Turkish context still apply mainly within the literature. As a result, a content analysis of the PhD theses on HRM in Turkish universities for the period after 2000 shows that qualitative research and a critical HRM paradigm are minimal, and exist in only a small number of studies, while new trends within the discipline were not followed closely or covering innovative and actual research topics.

Our findings propose that the creation of this discipline in a specific cultural context has been influenced by many factors, including the level of knowledge generation, as well as the country's economic development and institutional conditions. Some developments have been heavily influenced by the international literature on HRM, following Western organisations in acknowledging the importance of human capital in the success of organisations (Lawler et al., 2011; Welbourne, 2012). Based on our findings, we propose several research directions for future studies on HRM in Turkey. As most existing theories of management and organisational studies are based on the conditions and empirical data of Western economies, researchers have argued that Asian economies' contextual conditions may make Western concepts or theories irrelevant and therefore not able to be adopted (Meyer, 2007). The current combination of personnel management, HRM, and the introduction of SHRM in Turkey creates a real dilemma for HR researchers in using the research framework, as traditional HRM topics related to the application of HRM practices, such as

recruitment, selection, compensation, and training in a variety of organizational types, are common within the Turkish literature.

The literature demonstrates that high-performing organisations are characterised by the effectiveness of implemented HR practices (Guest & Conway, 2011). Therefore, an investigation of implemented HR practices could lead to a better understanding of sustainable performance in Turkish organisations (Huselid, 1995). Also, as prior studies have conceptually addressed the contextual conditions underlying the adoption of HR practices in Turkey, future studies can quantify the influences of institutional and economic conditions and challenges on the effectiveness of HRM implementation, and their effect on organizational performance in Turkish organizations.

Future studies should focus on HRM adoption in the private sector area, including small and medium-sized enterprises, as there has been a “big 500 fetishisms” in the academic publications of Turkish Academia, as most studies tend to use the largest 500 companies data set. As previously argued, context conditions play an essential role in the success or failure of organizations in a specific environment (Scott, 2008). Although institutional theory highlights the perspective of the isomorphism of management practices across organizations, the adoption of HRM is not likely to be identical across MNC subsidiaries in the same host country or the same region (Bjorkman et al., 2007).

Our study shows that there is a dominance of personnel management in line with the application of HRM and the emergence of SHRM in Turkey; therefore, future studies should look beyond the transferability of personnel management to HRM and SHRM.

Our study found that most prior studies have not explicitly specified the theoretical lens they use to examine their research problems and that the majority of studies have used a quantitative approach. Therefore, a well-developed theoretical framework of HRM and the use of a qualitative approach in future studies will be useful and vital for researchers, HR practitioners, and HR departments.

Future studies should explore the roles and impact of talent and acquisition issues such as employer branding, employability and innovative HR capital development, and the challenges they face in the transfer of management knowledge and practices towards human capital development within organizations. HRM practices for blue-collar employees are also a new research opportunity for the researchers. Workplace health and safety issues, as well as employee well-being perspectives, should be focused upon in future research on Turkish HRM.

The role of migration and refugees is another research direction that the Turkish HRM discipline should consider, as millions of Iraqi and Syrian refugees have fled to Turkey in recent years and they are becoming an important factor influencing the HR practices in Turkish companies. There has been minimal research on this issue. Thus there is an excellent opportunity here for researchers.

REFERENCES

- Akin, O. (2009). *Examination of human resource management on organizational performance: A study on ISO 500 companies*, Unpublished Dissertation, Ankara University.
- Aycan, Z. (2001). Human resource management in Turkey- Current issues and future challenges. *International Journal of Manpower*, 22(3), 252-260.
- Aycan, Z. (2006). Human resource management in Turkey. Budhwar, P. S. and Mellahi, K. (eds.) *Human resources management in the Middle East*, London: Routledge. 160-179.
- Aycan, Z., R. N. Kanungo, M. Mendonca, Y. Kaicheng and J. Deller, (2000) “Impact of culture on human resource management practices: a 10-country comparison”, *Applied Psychology: An International Review*, 49 (1), 192-221.

- Bawa, M. A., & Jantan, M. (2005). Human resource practices as determinants of employee turnover: an empirical investigation. *Asian Academy of Management Journal*, 10(2), 69-80.
- Bayraktar, O. (2002) *Competency-based human resource management and a case study in the banking sector*, Unpublished Dissertation, Istanbul University.
- Bayraktaroglu, S. and Ersoy Yılmaz, S. (2012) "The Relationship Between Business Ethics Practices and Organizational Performance in Human Resource Management: The Case of the Fortune 500 Turkey". *İş Ahlakı Dergisi*, 5(10), pp.117-148
- Bayraktaroglu S., Atay E. (2016). *Stratejik İnsan Kaynakları Yönetimi*. Istanbul: Beta
- Berkman, Ü., & Özen, Ş. (2008). Culture and management in Turkey: State-dependency and paternalism in transition. *Gestion en Contexte Interculturel: Approches, Problématiques, Pratiques et Plongées, Québec, Presse de l'Université Laval et Télé-université*, 1-23.
- Bjorkman, I., Fey, C. F., & Park, H. T. (2007). Institutional theory and MNC subsidiary HRM practices: Evidence from a three-country study. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 38(3), 430–446.
- Boon, C., Paauwe, J., Boselie, P., & Den Hartog, D. (2009). Institutional pressures and HRM: Developing institutional fit. *Personnel Review*, 38(5), 492–508
- Bratton, J., and J. Gold (2012). *Human Resource Management: Theory and Practice*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Budhwar, P., & Debrah, Y. 2009. Future research on human resource management systems in Asia. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, 26(2), 197–218.
- Cakal, M. (2017). *The assessment of perceived insider status and organizational culture perception of the human resources recruited from different sources*, Unpublished Dissertation, Sakarya University.
- Cooke, F. L. (2018). Concepts, contexts, and mindsets: Putting human resource management research in perspectives. *Human Resource Management Journal*, 28(1), 1-13.
- Erçek, M. (2006). HRMization in Turkey: Expanding the Rhetoric-Reality Debate in Space and Time. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 17(4), 648-672.
- Ersoy Y. S. (2012). *The relationship between organizational performance and business ethics applications at human resources management: A sample of Fortune Turkey's largest 500 corporations*, Unpublished Dissertation, Sakarya University.
- Farndale, E., Brewster, C., & Poutsma, E. 2008. Coordinated vs liberal market HRM: The impact of institutionalization on multinational firms. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 19(11), 2004–2023.
- Genc, K. Y. (2009). *Strategic human resources management - organizational performance relationship and an application on Turkey's big firms*, Unpublished Dissertation, Karadeniz Teknik University.
- Guest, D., & Conway, N. 2011. The impact of HR practices, HR effectiveness and a 'strong HR systems' on organisational outcomes: A stakeholder perspective. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 22(8), 1686–1702.
- Heugens, P. P., & Lander, M. W. 2009. Structure! Agency! (and other quarrels): A meta-analysis of institutional theories of organization. *Academy of Management Journal*, 52(1), 61–85.
- Hofstede, G., (1980) *Culture's consequences: International differences in work-related values*, Thousand Oaks, Sage.

- Hung, D. K. M., Ansari, M. A., & Aafaqi, R. (2004). Fairness of human resource management practices, leader-member exchange and organizational commitment. *Asian Academy of Management Journal*, 9(1), 99-120.
- Huselid, M. A. (1995). The impact of human resource management practices on turnover, productivity and corporate financial performance. *Academy of Management Journal*, 38(3), 635–672.
- Iqbal, M. Z. (2012). Expanded dimensions of the purposes and uses of performance appraisal. *Asian Academy of Management Journal*, 17(1), 41.
- Jackson, S. E., & Schuler, R. (1995). Understanding human resource management in the context of organizations and their environments. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 46(1), 237–264.
- Kabasakal, H., and M. Bodur, (1998) *Leadership, values, and institutions: The case of Turkey*, Research papers, İstanbul, Boğaziçi University.
- Lawler, J. J., Chen, S.-J., Wu, P.-C., Bae, J., & Bai, B. (2011). High-performance work systems in foreign subsidiaries of American multinationals: An institutional model. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 42(2), 202–220.
- Mellahi K., Mehmet, D., Collings, D. G., Tatoglu, E., Hughes, M. (2013) Similarly different: a Comparison of HRM practices in MNE subsidiaries and local firms in Turkey. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 24(12), 2339–2368.
- Meyer, K. E. (2007). Asian contexts and the search for general theory in management research: A rejoinder. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, 24(4), 527–537.
- Mohammad, J., Quoquab Habib, F., & Alias, M. A. (2011). Job Satisfaction and Organizational Citizenship Behavior: an Empirical Study at Higher Learning Institutions. *Asian Academy of Management Journal*, 16(2), 149-165.
- Mondy, R. W. (2008). *Human resource management* (10th ed.). Prentice Hall, NJ: Pearson
- Nasurdin, A. M., Hemdi, M. A., & Guat, L. P. (2008). Does perceived organizational support mediate the relationship between human resource management practices and organizational commitment? *Asian Academy of Management Journal*, 13(1), 15-36.
- Ozyurt, M. (2010). *The effects of managers' roles and organizational learning aspect to learning transfer and research*, Unpublished Dissertation, İstanbul University.
- Poon, I. H.-F., & Rowley, C. 2010. Change in Asia: A review of management theory and research related to human resources. *Asia Pacific Business Review*, 16(4), 591–607
- Powell, W. W., & DiMaggio, P. J. (Eds.) (2012). *The new institutionalism in organizational analysis*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Radzi, K. M., Nor, M. N. M., & Ali, S. M. (2017). The Impact of Internal Factors on Small Business Success: A Case of Small Enterprises Under the Felda Scheme. *Asian Academy of Management Journal*, 22(1), 27.
- Sardan, S. (2012). *Wage management in the cement industry: A comparative analysis*, Unpublished Dissertation, Gazi University.
- Scott, W. R. (Ed.) (2008). *Institutions and organizations—Ideas and interests*. Los Angeles: Sage.
- Seidman, I. (2013). *Interviewing as Qualitative Research: A Guide for Researchers in Education and the Social Sciences*. Teachers College Press.

Tregaskis, O., & Brewster, C. (2006). Converging or diverging? A comparative analysis of trends in contingent employment practice in Europe for over a decade. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 37(1), 111–126

Tuzuner, L. (2002). *The Measurement and evaluation of human resources management functions and research on evaluation of human resources management practices*, Unpublished Dissertation, Istanbul University.

Ulrich, D., & Dulebohn, J. H. (2015). Are we there yet? What's next for HR?. *Human Resource Management Review*, 25(2), 188–204.

Üsdiken, B. (1996). Importing theories of management and organization: The case of Turkish academia. *International Studies of Management & Organization*, 26(3), 33-46.

Üsdiken, B. and Çetin, D. (1999). Türkiye’de Akademik Dünyanın Yönetme İşine Yaklaşımında 1950’li Yıllarla Birlikte Ne Değişti? *Amme İdaresi Dergisi*, 32(4), 47-65.

Üsdiken, B. and Wasti, S. A. (2002). Türkiye’de Bir İnceleme Alanı Olarak Personel veya İnsan Kaynakları Yönetimi, 1972-1999. *Amme İdaresi Dergisi*, 35(3), 1-37.

Wasti, S.A. (1998). Cultural barriers in the transferability of Japanese and American human resources practices to developing countries: The Turkish case. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 9(4), 608-631.

Welbourne, T. M. (2012). Editor-in-chief’s note: HRM: The field of dreams. *Human Resource Management*, 51(3), 309–311.

Yaylaci, G. O. (2000), *Public relations role in career management process*, Unpublished Dissertation, Ege University.

Yenipinar, U. (2004). *The pricing systems of the accommodation and hotel administration and the application of this to the city of İzmir*, Unpublished Dissertation, 9 Eylül University.