

Arts Management – What and Why? Cultural Needs Assessments and Methodologies of Managing

Dr. İpek ÇANKAYA

Initiating Director and Principal Researcher *halka sanat projesi*-Istanbul/Bodrum, TR
Member of Artship Foundation Associate Scholars Core Group, San Francisco, USA
i2cankaya@gmail.com

Abstract

Origins-Intentions: The paper is based on the courses given by the author in the Arts Management Department at Yeditepe University, Istanbul between 2009 and 2016 and also on the Arts Management Internship Programme in Istanbul at halka sanat projesi between 2011 and 2020. The paper consists of three parts: A brief overview of the arts management as a field, assessments on the human cultural needs and reflections on the methodologies of managing in the art sector with the experience derived from directing an independent art initiative in Turkey. **Scale - Human Resources:** The focus of the paper leads towards rethinking the particular nature and widely shared elements of the cultural work regardless of its scale, popularity or connections. Human element is one of the most crucial assets in this dynamic. Management teams from senior members to fresh interns standing at diverse points of the cultural work take their place at the core of the discussion. **Expertise-Apprenticeship - Continuous Learning:** The paper centres around questions of what a good arts management is and why it is needed. The aim is to emphasize the importance of individual as well as collective practice, significance of the critical approach in management and the influence of continuous learning in the work environment to build upon the theoretical basis received at university level arts management education. The value of apprenticeship and the manifestations of diverse teaching methods will be highlighted.

Keywords: Arts Management, Cultural Needs, Methodologies of Managing, Continuous Learning, Apprenticeship

1. Arts Management

In the intersection of two fields, art and management, stands the area of Arts Management which requires its own set of curiosities, training and skills. The profession of managing the arts is more than a technical administrative vocation. In terms of research and training its history goes back to 1970s under the names of arts management or arts administration. In fact, it is noted that different names such as arts managements, arts administration, cultural management, and cultural administration all are used to almost entirely refer to the same profession (and the area of research and training) with some possible variations (DeVereaux,2019).

A personal commitment to art forms combined with knowledge in administrative sciences makes the core of the profession. It is the learning of handling the creative content with grounded, practical necessities. The arts management brain works well when it is the meeting of two islands: Abstract and creative like the mind of an artist and analytical and factual like that of an engineer.

Although sometimes confused, arts management is different than artist management services and the vocation of art direction in films, theatre, advertising or publications. The arts manager is the person who runs an art based operation, art space or organization. It is useful, and necessary to be in a teamwork with the artists to help them have a clear understanding of the professional needs not only in the creation phase but also in the representation, exhibition, promotion, communication and other aspects of sharing and offering their work. Taking each of these necessary steps by themselves

at the same professional level of knowledge and expertise exceeds the scope and expertise of most practicing artist. Most of the time artists need and are trained to concentrate on the creative side of their projects.

At this point, enters other art professionals such as the curators, publicists, and the focus group of this paper, the arts managers. Unlike the artists who focus on the creative elements of a project, art managers need to develop a peripheral vision and be able to handle the operation as a whole. Once pitched and accepted by art organisation the project becomes a collaboration, a shared aspiration and commitment for both parties. Metaphorically speaking about art and management professional relationship can be portrayed as if the creative content is the letter sent to the audience and the management skills and operation are the envelope. And this envelop contains and protects the integrity of the content.

An arts manager is someone open and trained to foresee the possibilities and potential an artistic work or a cultural project when working one on one with the artist on an upcoming presentation. They must also be capable of a rational strategic planning, accounting, marketing and logistics so that the creative art presentation possibilities successfully turn into flesh and blood realities without falling apart on the road or in action. The arts manager is ideally someone who open-mindedly responds to the artists' creative concepts, eager to explore ideas and give space to new approaches even if they are intangible at the initial moment.

The arts management practice is sometimes about containing the space, physically or culturally to enable the project to breath, flow and reach the audience. It also requires the arts manager to be able to consider the other side of the equation: The integrity of the space, event or programming. The target is not to get into a power struggle but achieve a meaningful collaboration between two allies. The artwork should neither hurt the sensibilities of the space (or organization) nor should the space kill the aspirations of the artist, [B] because contrary to some opposing arguments in a well-studied teamwork, artists and arts managers complement each other's efforts.

In short, good arts management is a people centred and engaged work as well as a solitary thinking and aspirational one. It requires the ability to develop connections, build relations and mediations among artists, audiences, organizations and fellow co-workers.

In summary, an arts manager is the one who is focused in a bigger picture on how the creative work is presented and communicated to the audience or how the assisting staff can be integrated in diverse steps of the project in their best possible versions of themselves to support its wellbeing and learn deeper sensibilities of the profession during the process. That is to say, the arts manager is the one who considers how the external conditions can be made favourable for a smooth flow of the operation in hand. In this sense, it is a team work and not an ego profession. The work speaks for itself.

Profession's Origins and Training

Arts management as an academic discipline as well as a practice of expertise has begun to grow towards the end of last century initially in the United States and United Kingdom. Among earliest publications in the field, *The Arts Management Handbook* (1974) and *The Arts Management Reader* (1979) by Alvin H. Reiss, and *Arts Administration* (1980) by John Pick can be mentioned (DeVereaux, 2019).

Since the 1970s, academic journals such as the *International Journal of Arts Management* (1998), *The Journal of Arts Management Law and Society* (1992), *American Journal of Arts Management* (2013), *Journal of Cultural Policy* (2011) which changed its name in 2020 as the *European Journal of Cultural Management and Policy*, many academic conferences and organizations such as AIMAC, the International Association for Arts and Cultural Management and ENCATC, European Network on Cultural Management and Policy among others are contributing to the development of the field.

Arts management education requires interdisciplinary pedagogy, as it draws from various disciplines, such as art and humanities sociology, social sciences, business administration and economics (Johansson, 2017). At university level studies of the arts management as a discipline trains future directors for cultural establishments such as galleries, museums, theatres, not-for-profit art organizations.

Arts management in any organisation is a combination of various skills. So is the teaching of the profession. There can be experimented general rules as a guideline but it also requires custom-made methods of teaching and practice. Paich, in his *Management Ambiguities: Non-Governmental, Charitable, Not for Profit, Spontaneous Initiatives* describes the managerial issues as logistical, procedural and academic but also psychological, social and cultural. He emphasizes that "meeting the learning needs of self-motivated, independent learners with individual goals requires different skills of teaching and learning" (Paich, 2020).

Since curatorial studies is one of its major teaching subjects in almost all university level curricula, some among the arts management graduates become future curators. It is not necessarily a rule but mostly in small organizations the resident curator can be the manager of the organisation as well. In Turkey for instance some of the founders of independent art initiatives are either artists or curators with academic managerial skills gathered during the university education. Continued training in the work place and apprenticeship after graduation pay off in both gallery management and curatorship for fresh arts management graduates finding their place in the cultural work environment. Assessments on the learning process and personal development in the work place will further be illustrated in the third part of this paper when methodologies of managing are discussed.

As may be the case in any other field, the emergence of the discipline of arts management around the world has not been synchronized. Consequently, its diffusion has not occurred at the same time or rate. In Turkey for instance, earliest examples of arts management departments in universities date back to late 1990s. As of 2020, there are ten Arts and Culture Management programmes on the undergraduate level, 70% of which are in privately founded universities and three are in public universities. All except one in Düzce are located in Istanbul. Number of MA programmes is limited to four, all of which are available in privately founded universities in Istanbul (Öztürk and Kurt, 2020).

The reception of arts management as a profession is challenging. Arts management is not unanimously received well as a profession. Traditionally in cultural organizations, the position of a space or gallery director and their teams responsible for marketing and communication, audience development, project management, artist relations and alike are filled with people coming from different backgrounds. Nevertheless, it can be said that a body of knowledge is constituted through research and publications, and that the new knowledge thereby acquired is transmitted via specialized training programs. The expansion and accumulation of this knowledge is what lends legitimacy to a new discipline, allowing it to eventually be regarded as a discipline in its own right (Evrard and Colbert, 2000).

Although the differences of opinion on the nature and place of the profession prevail, with the new millennium arts and culture management has begun to be considered as a discipline, which means that various positions in museums, not-for profit and for profit art organizations have new candidates coming to join the work force. The theory and formal training creates an awareness in the practical field and in accordance with this awareness, the formal training opportunities find their place in newly launched arts and cultural management departments of universities more often. The increase in number of cultural organisations in a society is the third parameter in this equation. As a result, theory, practice and academia feed each other.

More clearly, the research and academic training and the need for educated art professionals working in the field are closely related to the arts and culture dynamics paradigms in different

societies. Universities are the source that provide human resources with the basic knowledge required to be employed in these paradigms.

For Turkey, the period starting from the late 1990s has faced these following developments: The increase in art collection on individual and corporate capacity; large scale international events such as music, cinema and performing arts festivals, the inauguration of the International Istanbul Biennale as the pioneer of others in different cities of Turkey in the following decade¹.

The intensification of the art market has continued in the new millennium with new private art museums by corporate capital through establishing foundations, increase in number and volume of commercial art galleries and auction houses by a new generation of entrepreneurs, and several international art fairs as new additions to the commodified culture. All of these entities being in growth, the 2000s has also witnessed the circulation of independent and mostly artist-led, not-for profit art initiatives that create another paradigm in the culture sector. Hence, the opening of the above-mentioned arts and culture management departments in universities make sense in the light of with these developments.

Arts management curricula topics can usually be grouped in three categories:

- **Arts and culture content** (i.e. art history, art criticism, curatorial studies, art writing, visual arts, aesthetics, humanities, art and cultural theory, cultural policy, cultural heritage, urban culture)
- **Managing the arts events/organizations** (i.e. events management, budget and planning, fundraising, audience development, human resource management, exhibition management, curatorial studies)
- **Arts business practice** (economics, accounting, and organisational behaviour, outreach financing)

The combination of these three categories namely arts and culture, management and business aim to give an open perspective and basic knowledge to the future professionals of the culture sector. This base is open to be developed with active practice and continuous learning in different paradigms of the arts and cultural field.

2. Cultural Needs Assessments

Since the dawn of history humans are in need of expressing themselves. The urge to create and share with others is deeply connected to this need. In that sense cultural need is inborn. Culture, in its broadest definition is 'a particular way of life of whether a people, a period, a group or humanity in general (Williams, 1976:90). And culture manifests itself in traditions, values, artefacts and systems. Ways of cooking, clothing, housing or celebrating are some of these manifestations. A process of an intellectual, spiritual and aesthetic development is also referred as culture. Finally works and practices of intellectual and especially artistic activity fall in the scope of culture (ibid: 90). Hence, one may say that the cultural work is a manifestation of creative expression, which works through the production of symbols, texts, sound notations, and visual gestures and create sharable meaning. In this respect, art is a transformative and multi-layered form of culture which responds to the needs of everyone involved. Cultural need is shared not only the creators of meaning (artists, writers, curators, musicians, performers) but also the users (readers, viewers, and other audiences) who side by side take part in the process because some form of the urge to fulfil oneself is innate for all.

In the material world, when products are concerned, the first aspect that comes to mind usually happens to be functionality. How useful they are, what they are good for and how much, are some of the initial questions. But when one is concerned with the products of culture another term emerges on the surface: The power of creating meaning.

¹ Sinopale in Sinop (2006), Çanakkale Biennial (2008) and Mardin Biennial (2010) are among the prominent ones.

Bank in her writings about the cultural work talks about the distinction between the cultural and non-cultural assets by saying that 'aesthetic' and 'symbolic' goods and services are phenomena that are the carriers of meaning in the form of images, symbols, signs and sounds (2007). One can suggest that this definition is also valid for experiences and learning too. In cultural assets the emphasis is on their 'aesthetic' and 'symbolic' character, whereas in the non-cultural assets it is in their use-value.

For instance, when people are facing a poem, a play, a carpet design or a pre-historic cutlery they are in fact in front of the discovery of a meaning, something to make sense from and relate to. So, if the question is: What do we find meaningful? Then, the answer usually goes like: "We find meaningful what we can connect with, care for, and what touches our intellect, psychology or perception of life in some ways which are naturally subjective. That is why a work of art and culture speaks to human senses and existential needs.

A known well-intentioned but hierarchical theory on human needs dates back to 1943 (Jerome, 2013). A Theory of Human Motivation by A. H. Maslow formulates five different categories of human needs. Defined in the form of a pyramid, each category is argued to build upon another and only after the satisfaction of the former the latter can be focused on and be fulfilled. The five layers of the human needs pyramid are made of physiological needs (a.k.a. biological needs), safety needs (i.e. security, health, employment) needs for love, affection and belonging, self-esteem (respect, recognition, strength) and finally self-actualisation (growth towards achieving one's full potential). Maslow's assessment is that the creative activities fall only into the final category of this hierarchy.

At this point, what I want to argue is that after the fulfilment of basic needs defined in the earlier steps of the pyramid, that is to say, after achieving the fundamental needs for being alive (having access to clean water, air, food, a surviving health condition etc.) cultural needs immediately appear within the mix as well.

Being a part of a culture and creating an attribute of it, already affiliate with the human sense of belonging, recognition and aiming at a better version of oneself. Being in a group who creates and shares culture (a meaning in the form of signs, symbols, texts or sounds) makes sense to most people. It is not wrong to say that artists although working with deep commitment are not necessarily in their best health or social conditions to make art. Looking at artists biographies in history the lack of rewarding circumstances or fulfilling assets are not enough to stop them. Or, not all tribal communities who share their rituals around the fire are fully satisfied of their safety and security, but they still gather together to share their stories, sing and dances.

Quoting from Doğu Çankaya, a practising artist and a close collaborator of *halka sanat projesi*-Istanbul/Bodrum:

"Art is something done by those who suffer from its absence, and not by those who are happy with its existence."

(<https://www.aysegulayhakyemez.com/2012/12/dogu-cankaya-sanat-varligindan-degil-de-yoklugundan-muzdarip-olan-insanlarin-yaptigi-bir-sey.html>)

In other words, if there is a pyramid of human needs, cultural needs surface in its much earlier steps. Sometimes, artists come among those who create not by calculated choices or preferences, but they produce because they cannot resist to not to do otherwise.

Creating some elements of culture, an artefact, a narrative is also coming from that same inner source. Taking active part in the creation, sharing and circulation of a work of culture means being a part of a larger human community with similar sensibilities and needs of creating meaning in life.

In a compass of meaning or functionality, a play as an artefact of culture, compared to another product in another sector (i.e. a car or a hairdryer), is rich in meaning but poor in seemingly practical functionality. Its benefit is not in its practicality but somewhere else. That is why an artwork is rather

a symbolic apparatus that encompasses human psychological needs and nourishes diverse modes of being human. These modes may be in contact with an emotion, an idea or an attitude. In this sense, the engagement with a cultural work either on the production or the sharing side contributes both to individual and collective social bonding. It has different dynamics, responses and priorities.

Spokespersons of an economic perspective anchor the cultural work to the concept of the cultural and creative industries which bring forth the economic action and the commercial side of it, by taking cultural work mainly as a business whose object is a cultural product. Comparing the cultural work with one of its extended family members, the advertising for instance, one may rightfully quote from Hamlet in describing his own relation with his uncle Claudius, the new king of Denmark as being “more than kin but less than kind”. It means that cultural work and advertising may have touching elbows in the creative universe, yet their priorities do not necessarily match. The cultural work may be community focused or non-profit oriented as it may be born out of an instinctive need whereas the advertisement is a child of pre-designed culture and is there to serve it. They may be closer to each other than family relatives but they may not be the same in nature or motivation. The cultural work is the offspring of a need and the advertisement is that of a branded culture.

3. Methodologies of Managing

The language and methodologies of the commercial art market and its work force members' experiences are beyond the scope of this paper. What is interested in here, is a form of practice exercised by professionals with alternative aims and priorities, that is to say the working methodologies of those who approach to cultural work as an extension of need to share and who work in favour of more voices in the cultural field.

Cultural work and not-for profit organization models are not mutually exclusive. Art managers are needed in the non-profit sector as well as they find jobs in the commercial side of culture. The objectives of art organizations both in the profit making business (i.e. commercial galleries) and in the not-for-profits (i.e. art initiatives) determine only which paths to follow, and do not change the positive impact of directed by professional managers.

Management in a not-for-profit organization has its own methodologies. This section exemplifies some of them, accumulated in years, out of personal experience. Although this section is mostly based on the author's personal experiences as the director of a small scale, not-for-profit art organisation in Turkey the paper prefers to maintain the third person voice in order to keep an academic and critical distance.

First of all, regardless in what context it takes place, a good arts management means inclusion. Art, like all cultural practice, is a team work in many ways. Even if an artwork is the result of an individual creation by an artist, when it comes to sharing with an audience it requires a collective effort and division of responsibilities. In an organisation everyone from the resident curator to facility manager and teams of employees, volunteers and interns have their share of tasks during the process.

Cultural work in the not-for-profit is the definition of working collectively but it demands a clear division of duties to avoid gaps and chaos. This brings forth the necessity of everyone involved in the project being equipped with the proper knowledge concerning how to achieve their work. This type of education is based primarily on formal training during university education but also it is acquired in the work place and shaped according to the ethos of the organization. It needs time, motivation, training and practice to master it. While formal education prepares the fundamental knowledge base, the work place, especially for young workers, is an incubator for vocational training that shapes the new additions to the cultural work force.

The examples and references below show that diverse sources researching about the place and nature of apprenticeship come to similar conclusions and find reasons to establish and encourage this system of learning in different ways.

Apprenticeships and other work-based training possibilities is a one way of transition in the career development paths of young graduates or post-graduates. As noted by the G20 Task Force on Employment “apprenticeships are a combination of on-the-job training and school-based education (2012).

Most of the time, especially in smaller organisations, the arts manager is responsible with the continuing education of the staff. That is how young graduates are learning practical and sometimes theoretical knowledge on arts management from their directors in the organisation where they pursue their internship. If the arts manager is also a curator, then, training in curatorship also becomes a part of the process.

International Labour Organisation (ILO) indicates that the term “apprenticeship” is generic name that can be replaced with alternatives such as “traineeships”, “internships”, “learnerships” and “work placements” in different geographies (2012). As George, in his book entitled *The Curator’s Handbook* indicates that “interns are often essential in order to support the delivery of a programme or project and in return they gain a significant amount of hands-on experience along the way. Both parties ultimately benefit from the experience” (2015:22).

Although there is no universal standards for internship programmes, several public establishments on governmental level and private organizations such as museums and art spaces around the world are advocating the internship system.

A museum example can be MoMA PS1, founded in 1971 as the first non-profit arts centre focused on contemporary arts in the US. The organisation conducts seven-month internships for graduates of bachelor’s or master’s degree programs to give practical and theoretical training in museum work. Internships provide training in specific museum fields through close work with a professional staff member, familiarity with modern and contemporary art through seminars and discussions, and an educational program that exposes interns to the workings of the museum as a whole, while considering the role of museums in the broader cultural context.

The joint-report by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) and International Labour Organisation (ILO) called *Engaging Employees in Apprenticeship Opportunities* states that apprenticeship and other work-based training are significant opportunities and valuable pathways in the transition from the university to work (OECD/ILO, 2017).

The report shows cases public examples from UK, Norway, Germany, Australia, New Zealand, US, Turkey, Bangladesh and India. The report marks that early experiences in the labour market can affect the nature and duration of employment throughout the entire working life. In this context, work-based training opportunities and apprenticeships show up as helpful means to better connect the education system with the labour market. Apprenticeships are programmes provided to aspiring young people that involve work-based training convey job-specific and general skills that would serve in their future life.

Each country has their own policy that shape the nature and composition of work-based training opportunities and apprenticeship system. In the German case for example, vocational education system has a dual nature that is the combination of “on-the-job” training in an enterprise and theoretical training at school. The system is designed to help to transit into high quality and desirable employment. The authorities pursue initiatives to improve the integration of young people to the work force on national, regional and local levels.

Similarly, vocational training and education (VET) system in Turkey has a dual character, with both theoretical (school-based training) and practical (work-based training/practical training in schools) dimensions. Along with courses and certificate programmes conducted by the national government and local authorities, companies also provide training opportunities to VET upper secondary school students as interns, and apprentices. Furthermore, companies and cultural organisations hide interns

temporarily or to be later on recruited as full-time employees and give them training according to the vision and goals of the organisation.

The above-mentioned OECD/ILO report of 2017 also collects data from various academic papers to summarize the Ottoman system of apprenticeship:

"As an example of work-based training apprenticeship in Turkey has a long tradition and dates back to the 13th century with the foundation of Ahi Associations, a fraternity organisation with regulates the rules and operations of trades and workshops (Özyılmaz, 2011). An important function of Ahi Associations was training the young through work. Education and training in the Ahi system integrated vocational training at the workshop with general and social education at dervish lodge (zaviye, religious school) (Çağatay, 1989). One would start working in an occupation as an assistant apprentice and through the years would become first an apprentice, then a journeyman, and finally a master. (Ekinci, 1990; Çağatay, 1989)."

Currently in Turkey universities require a short-term internship in their curriculum in the field of arts management. Soon to be graduates need to be engaged with companies and organisations active in cultural work for a period of thirty work days and provide a document from their employers certifying and detailing their experience during the internship.

The Case Example on the Methodologies of Managing: *halka sanat projesi*²

halka sanat projesi, a not-for profit art initiative set in motion in May 2011 in Istanbul without depending on any institutional or corporate sponsorship is an example of cultural organisations that support the internship involvement and training.

The organisation works in the production, discourse and presentation of contemporary art and culture with commitment to community, environment and education. Within the context of the contemporary art scene in Turkey which is mostly shaped by and in the form of large scale institutions and sponsorships, *halka sanat projesi* maintains its independent and professional spot. In that sense, it is run by a deep commitment that is based on the "teaching by its example" and thus aims to create its authentic and responsive culture.

halka shows strong commitment to young professionals graduated from the arts management faculties by functioning like a laboratory in which they can turn their theoretical knowledge to practice on subjects such as gallery management, curatorial issues, project development, communication and networking (www.halkaartproject.net).

Since the early days, interns make a substantial part of the organisation's working team. The fact that the initiating director of the organisation was teaching at the Arts Management Department of Yeditepe University Istanbul helped the organisation to acknowledge two issues very early:

- One, a committed art organisation should be engaged in the further vocational training and employment of the young graduates in the art field in order to contribute to the development of the next generation of arts managers.
- Two, since the early 2000s, as universities open Arts and Cultural Management Departments, discussed in the earlier section of this paper, there are quite a number of young people coming from the formal education who aim to join the professional work force. Because not all arts management positions are necessarily filled by graduates of this discipline. That is why one of *halka's* goals is set to be a micro laboratory for the future arts managers at its modest scale.

²The name of the organisation that can be translated into English as *halka art project* is deliberately written in small letters as a part of its manifesto and identity.

The immediate photo of Figure-1 below shows people who have been part of *halka sanat projesi* since its initiation. Seventeen people are shown in the photo and nine more are mentioned in the section below it. Out of these twenty-six names, sixteen are the former students of the initiating director and started their career as interns at *halka* (at the end of their internship some joined the team, some continue to search their path elsewhere in the professional life). Five others have acquired all they know on arts management thanks to the time they have become interns or volunteers and later on team members at *halka*. Figure-1 also features four other people who were in the directing position in the organisation at some point of its history.

Figure-1: Halka Team Members and Interns throughout Time



Soldan sağa, bugünden geçmişe doğru, *halka*'da yolculuk edenler
Traveller's at *halka*, from left to right, from present to past

İpek Çankaya	Bugün/Today - 2011	Aydan Yıldızhan	2017 - 2016
Bahar Güneş	Bugün/Today - 2016	Sezgi Abalı	2016 - 2011
Öykü Demirci	Bugün/Today - 2017	Cansu Attal	2016 - 2013
Sevda Bad	Bugün/Today - 2018	Gözde Kırsekiz	2015 - 2014
Mehmetcan Çökük	Bugün/Today - 2019	Hande Başargün	2014 - 2012
Yavuztan İnam	2018 - 2017	Ceren Kartal	2014 - 2012
Miray Eren	2018 - 2017	Zeynep Çelebi	2013- 2012
Elif Yıldız	2017 - 2016	Ayşe Kâya	2012 - 2011
Başak Deniz Çimen	2017 - 2016		

*Ve portre galerisinde olmayan, halka'da emeği olan stajyer, gönüllü ve dostlar
And other friends, interns and volunteers who are not in the portrait gallery*

Gülipek Fırat, Özge Melis Akpınar, Fem Bozdağ, Gökçe Pekcan, Anna Kudron, Gözde Güngör, Cansu Çiçeğim Yüreklı, Giray Görür, Sercan Varol

Hans Ulrich Obrist, Co-Director, Exhibitions and Programmes and Director of International Projects Serpentine Galleries, London states:

“I think that everyone has to find his or her own way... The last thing a teacher should do is to try to prescribe models” (Adrian, 2015:24).

Similar to the idea of Obrist, the teaching technic at *halka* is not an imposing one, it rather aims to show a guideline. As mentioned in the organisation website this approach is based on the “teaching by its example” principle where the director personally shows how to do different requirements of managerial tasks. Hence, the director by actively working in every aspect of the organisation sets an example to the interns and train them on issues such as: Space management, exhibition management, written and verbal communication on behalf of the organisation and acquisition of a co-shared vocabulary and behavioural patterns toward the artists, audience, technical collaborators and other members of the larger art community.

In *halka*'s culture meetings are very important in the process of developing and orchestrating a new project. Sometimes it is the smallest things that pay off in the long run. For instance, at the beginning instead of assigning a co-worker as the meeting secretary, the director was the one person who always took notes during an artist meeting or an internal brainstorming gathering. After a while, comparing notes and discussing the issues at hand became a custom in the group and everybody assimilated the action, which enables them to stay concentrated and as focused as possible in the details and next steps to take. As a result interns and co-workers, regardless of their time spent in the organisation, eventually acquire a more structured awareness of the projects at the best of their abilities. Organisations having more than one project at a time face the risk of missing details about each of them whereas simple things like keeping notes, revisiting them, sharing and fulfilling the responsibilities afterwards and clearing the achieved ones from the list is way of keeping the project alive and the team active and it is learnt through observation and adaptation of a certain behaviour shown by the leadership.

Also, each organisation build its own culture of doing things. Interns and other team members working closely with the director adopt a certain way of approaching the initiative's unspoken working style toward meaningful collaboration. In the communication with the artists this assimilated working style can be witnessed in the way that the team members talk. Hearing a co-worker approaching a collaborator in a way that represents the organisation's culture is not something that happens on its own but it is something to be achieved through witnessing, practicing and assimilating. A genuine cohesion in language and manners, with individual spontaneity and individuality creates the character of the organisation and it is passed through sharing leadership experiences, counselling on possible results and learning from mistakes. In the long run, everyone's embracing the organisation's values and leadership priorities can create a cohesive working and management style.

Learning through the example and experience may have many forms. *halka sanat projesi*'s team members aim to help the artists represent and share they work the best possible way responding to the nature of their artwork. Artist-in-residence Programme where the interns learn how to be an artist assistant is a good example for this. Working with experienced artists and curators, the interns and co-workers learn to pay attention to details, respond to the various methods of working and adjust the shortcomings of the original plan or previously uninformed way of doing things. Sometimes it is the simple things like helping to arrange a table cloth specially chosen and curated to be the carrying element of the exhibition. Also, painting extension cables in white of the exhibition space to neutralize them. Such seemingly simple action in the space creates the awareness on how the mind of a curator works in displaying and transforming a space.

Another example of working with details that will ultimately make a difference in tuning in a space is that of an intern at *halka* who spent a day placing four bags of pebble stones in the exhibition space. One day the interns helped a close collaborator and a very experienced curator who was the artist-in-residence at the time to arrange the exhibition space which was previously a garden area and turned into a white room that became an exhibition and performance space for *halka sanat projesi*. As a part of its original adoption the room had pebble stones at the bottom of both side walls but the

stones partially went missing in time leaving an unpleasant exposure of concrete foundations. So, to fill the empty space, four bags of white pebbles were bought online and got delivered to the gallery space. One of the interns spent the day by grouping the stones by size and placing them one by one in the missing spots to obtain a full and stylised look under the supervision of the Artist-in-Residence who was the curator of the upcoming exhibition. Effortless and hardly noticed, the space acquired unity and the floor didn't detract from the exhibitions focused, the artwork.

Vanessa Paz Dennen in her paper *Cognitive Apprenticeship in Educational Practice: Research on Scaffolding, Modeling, Mentoring, and Coaching as Instructional Strategies* explains:

“Teaching and learning through cognitive apprenticeship requires making tacit processes visible to learners so they can observe and then practice them (Collins et al., 1989).”

Dennen also refers to J. Enkenberg's methods supporting the goals of cognitive apprenticeship that may contextualize and give a glimpse of the theoretical background and processes discussed in this paper:

Modeling: meaning the demonstration of the temporal process of thinking.

Explanation: explaining why activities take place as they do.

Coaching: meaning the monitoring of students' activities and assisting and supporting them where necessary.

Scaffolding: meaning support of students so that they can cope with the task situation. The strategy also entails the gradual withdrawal of teacher from the process, when the students can manage on their own.

Reflection: the student assesses and analyses his performance.

Articulation: the results of reflection are put into verbal form.

Explorations: the students are encouraged to form hypotheses, to test them, and to find new ideas and viewpoints. (Enkenberg, 2001, p. 503)

To sum up, Dennen deduces that both Enkenberg and Collins et al.'s approaches present similar strategies on teaching and learning through cognitive apprenticeship. In Collins et al. the teaching method is based on making the invisible processes visible by the teacher so that the learner can make observation and become capable of practicing them. Similarly, each step in Enkenberg's list documented above has the teacher's or the expert's actions at its core, and the learners (i.e. apprentices) are engaged in observation, modelling, reflection and articulation which lead them to practice.

4. Conclusion

Arts management is a growing academic discipline that has international acceptance since the late 1960s. Following their own needs and social requirements, different geographies and organisations in their own way have embraced benefits of this discipline which stands in the intersection of two fields: Arts and management.

As people need to fulfil the innate human urge to create and share with their communities, cultural work evolve and gets more complicated. That is why it requires various art professionals who can collaborate and cover different aspects of the cultural work. Artists, curators, art managers, gallery owners, entrepreneurs and initiators are among this selection.

In the twenty first century, arts management is initially taught through formal education at universities, but learning continues in work places. In that respect, internship and work place training is considered valuable by authorities like UNESCO, municipal and independent art organisations and curatorial peers working in the cultural field in general.

A good arts management practice with an additional aim to reinforce the work place training requires sharing former experiences, caringly revisiting mistakes to learn from, working all together on a current project by dividing its elements among the team members according to their talents and interests. Assigning tasks, monitoring and helping during the process is a part of the method. Giving space and voice to everyone as a method of learning and growing is highly cherished. Criticism is considered positive, mistakes are revisited not to judge but to enhance training and adjusting oneself for similar occasions in the future.

Listening is considered highly important. The method is based on thinking through writing things down. Making notes, keeping an agenda for each project on weekly basis and clearing each component of a specific task from the list when accomplished is essential. The agenda is used as a way of thinking ahead the following steps so that there is no rapture in the flow of events and being able to develop a peripheral vision covering different aspects of a project becomes systematized. When it works, it becomes a bloodstream of the project and energizes collaboration spirit. When neglected, ignored or forgotten it creates slowing down, inertia and people just going through motions.

To teach by setting up an example is a technic that enriches unity, collectivism and creates a co-shared character for the organisation. Understanding the daily need of attention to issues such as the maintenance of the space, following up the daily logistics, making appearances in the gatherings not only in the organisations' events but also in those of the colleagues and larger art circles to show solidarity and represent the organisation is considered valuable and encouraged for all. Photographing a current exhibition, writing a project description and additional texts for a project, assisting a collaborating artist on daily basis, sending regular newsletter to the audience or managing the social media accounts can be assigned to specific team member. If we are to summarise the processes addressed in this paper and the motivation to present it, the ethos of the apprentice programme discussed and suggested could be in these words: The respect and flow of learning from the more experienced practitioner to the novice without insisting on authority, "hands-on working together" are a major principle.

References

- Banks, M. (2007). *The Politics of cultural work*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Collins, A., Brown, J. S., & Newman, S. E. (1989). Cognitive apprenticeship: Teaching the craft of reading, writing, and mathematics. In L. B. Resnick (Ed.), *Knowing, learning, and instruction: Essays in honor of Robert Glaser* (pp. 453–494). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Çankaya, D. (2012, December 5). Interview by A.G. Hakyemez [Tape Recording]. Art is something done by those who suffer from its absence, and not by those are happy with its existence. Bir Başka İstanbul. Retrieved from: <https://www.aysegulayhakyemez.com/2012/12/dogu-cankaya-sanat-varligindan-degil-de-yoklugundan-muzdarip-olan-insanlarin-yaptigi-bir-sey.html>
- Dennen, V. P. (2004). *Cognitive Apprenticeship in Educational Practice: Research on Scaffolding, Modeling, Mentoring, and Coaching as Instructional Strategies*. In D. H. Jonassen (Ed.), *Handbook of research on educational communications and technology*, 813–828. Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.
- DeVereaux, C. (2019). *Arts and cultural management: Sense and sensibilities in the state of the field*, C. DeVereaux (Ed.). Routledge: NY
- Enkenberg, J. (2001). Instructional design and emerging models in higher education. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 17, 495–506. doi:10.1016/S0747-5632(01)00021-8
- Evrard, Y and Colbert, F. (2000) Arts Management: A New Discipline Entering the Millennium? *International Journal of Arts Management*, 2(2), 4-13

G20 (2012). G20 Task Force on Employment, Key Elements of Quality Apprenticeships, Retrieved from https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_218209.pdf

George, A. (2015). *The Curator's handbook*. London: Thames & Hudson.

Halka Sanat Projesi (2021). Retrieved from <http://www.halkaartproject.net>

International Labour Organisation (ILO) (2012) Overview of Apprenticeship Systems and Issues, ILO Contribution to the G20 Task Force on Employment, https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ifp_skills/documents/genericdocument/wcms_190188.pdf

Jerome, N. (2013). Application of the Maslow's hierarchy of need theory; impacts and implications on organizational culture, human resource and employee's performance. *International Journal of Business and Management Invention*, 2(3), 39 – 45.

Johansson, T. (2017). *Making sense of arts management: Research, Cases and Practices*. Johansson, T. & Luonila, M. (Eds.). Sibeliuss Academy Publications 11. Helsinki: Unigrafia.

Museum of Modern Art (2021). Retrieved from: <https://www.moma.org/about/get-involved/internships>

OECD/ILO (2017). Engaging Employers in Apprenticeship Opportunities: Making It Happen Locally, *OECD Publishing*, Paris, <https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264266681-en>.

Öztürk, Y. and Kurt, B. (2020). Sanat ve Kültür Yönetimi Eğitimi: Tarihsel ve Karşılaştırmalı Bir Giriş Denemesi [Arts and Culture Management Education: An Essay on a Historical and Comparative Introduction]. *Yedi*, 23, 45-57, doi: 10.17484/yedi.611731

Paich, S.D. (2020, September 17-18). Management Ambiguities: Non-Governmental, Charitable, Not for Profit, Spontaneous Initiatives [Paper Presentation], UYSAD V. International Management and Social Sciences Conference, Istanbul, Turkey. ISBN: 978-605-65197-8-9

Williams, R. (1976). *Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society*. NY: Oxford University Press